



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Chemical Science Journal
Manuscript Number:	2013_ACSj_4957
Title of the Manuscript:	Fe_{0.2}Al_{1.8}Zn₁₀O₄ Composite: An Efficient Catalyst for the Synthesis of 1, 4-Dihydropyridine Derivatives

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
1- You must present spectral data, ¹ H NMR, MAS, IR, ¹³ C NMR, Elemental Analytical for entries 4, 7, 9 and 11.	1- Since the compounds were already reported in literature; we have characterized only the representative compounds and confirmed the remaining by comparison of their physical constants already from literature values.
2- Why you did not present spectra data: Mass and Elemental Analytical for compounds!??? you must use Mass and Elemental Analytical for entries: 1,2,4,7,8,9,11.	2- The compounds being previously reported it seems to be not necessary to characterize all compounds by all spectral techniques. We apologize for it.
3-You used acetonitrile as solvent, and the solvents with other catalysts, you present a comparison of some solvents with Fe _{0.2} Al _{1.8} Zn ₁ O ₄ composite and Sulfonic acid on silica gel (0.2 g/mmol), you present the explanations about this comparison in the results and discussion.	3- A little discussion for the use of acetonitrile is provided in line no.132-134.
4-You compared effective of catalysts with Fe _{0.2} Al _{1.8} Zn ₁ O ₄ composite, you must write explanations about this comparison in the section of results and discussion and to discuss this composite with other catalysts.	4- Line no.132-134 have been added to the result and discussion part of the manuscript.
5-You must write explanations about recycle study in the section of results and discussion	5- Line no. 125-127 are added for this discussion.
6- You must present and write regeneration of the catalyst for reuse in this synthesis, in the experimental section.	6- Line no 83-84 are added in the experimental.
7- You did not present any physical chemistry data of Fe _{0.2} Al _{1.8} Zn ₁ O ₄ Composite, this data is necessary.	7- The data is under consideration for publication to another journal of material science. At this current time we can not disclose it. We apologize for it.